

MUDD DESIGN WORKSHOP II  
DESIGNING DESIGN EDUCATION FOR THE 21ST CENTURY  
Proceedings of a Workshop  
19-21 May 1999  
Clive L. Dym, Editor

# DESIGN

Center for Design Education  
Harvey Mudd College  
Claremont, California, USA



## Foreword

The papers in this volume represent the proceedings of the workshop, “Designing Design Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century,” that was held on the campus of Harvey Mudd College in Claremont, California, on 19–21 May 1999. Supported by the GE Fund, Hughes Electronics and Harvey Mudd College, this workshop brought together design educators, researchers, and practitioners to focus on future directions for engineering design education. Participants spent two and one-half days discussing the design of engineering design education, in order to identify and propose key ways to improve engineering design education.

The workshop sessions were constructed to give *everyone* a chance to participate, to be heard as well as to listen. Workshop sessions were typically scheduled for two hours, starting with brief presentations by four panelists in each session, and concluding with moderated, open discussion. Panelists were asked to reflect on ideas and attitudes about things to be done in the future, rather than focusing on current research. The panelists’ position papers appear on the following pages.

Three luncheon talks were presented. Sheri D. Sheppard took the opening lunch audience through a very interesting, team-based design exercise as she talked about “Compatibility (or Incompatibility) of How We Teach Engineering Design and Analysis.” At the second lunch, Woodie C. Flowers asked, “Presence or Telepresence? What Will Professors Do?” At our final luncheon, Jami J. Shah suggested “Promoting Design Skills Through Appropriate Grading Criteria.”

In addition, our banquet speaker on Thursday night was the founding president of the new Franklin W. Olin College of Engineering, Richard Miller. Rick talked to us about the design of a new engineering school, ranging from campus design to curriculum design.

As the principal organizer of this workshop, I want to acknowledge the inestimable support of the Advisory Committee: Steven J. Fenves, Carnegie Mellon University; Woodie C. Flowers, Massachusetts Institute of Technology; George A. Hazelrigg, National Science Foundation; Patrick Little, Harvey Mudd College; Gregory B. Olson, Northwestern University; John W. Prados, University of Tennessee; Jami J. Shah, Arizona State University; Sheri D. Sheppard, Stanford University; and John W. Wesner, Lucent Technologies. The Advisory Committee’s involvement made Mudd Design Workshop II bigger, more exciting, and more challenging than its 1997 predecessor.

Second, thanks to Harvey Mudd College and many of my colleagues, including: Rich Phillips, then-Chair of the Engineering Department; Sheldon Wettack, Dean of Faculty; Jon Strauss, President; Sally Rich Arroyo of College Relations; and *especially* Holly Hauck, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences. Holly really did make this workshop’s train run—and arrive—on time and in style!! And, of course, many thanks to the GE Fund, Harvey Mudd College, and Hughes Electronics for their generous financial support.

Clive L. Dym  
Director, Center for Design Education  
Fletcher Jones Professor of Engineering Design  
Harvey Mudd College

# Table of Contents

## Opening Luncheon Talk

Sheri D. Sheppard, <i>The Compatibility (or Incompatibility) of How We Teach Engineering Design and Analysis</i>	3
--	---

## Session 1. Themes for design education.

Bernd Bender, <i>Conceptions for Purposeful and Motivating Teaching and Learning in Engineering Design Courses</i>	15
Rolf A. Faste, <i>The Human Challenge in Engineering Design</i>	21
Frank J. Fronczak, <i>Design Engineers—Fast, Cheap, Good—Pick Any Two of the Three</i>	29
Barry I. Hyman, <i>From Capstone to Cornerstone—A New Paradigm for Design Education</i>	33

## Session 2. Design projects as cornerstone.

Renate Fruchter, <i>Dimensions of Teamwork Education</i>	43
Christopher D. Pionke, J. Roger Parsons, J. Elaine Seat, Fred E. Weber, and Daniel C. Yoder, <i>Balancing Capability, Enthusiasm, and Methodology in a Freshman Design Program</i>	49
Thomas R. Kurfess, <i>Challenges and Directions for Integrating Mechatronics into Early Design</i>	55
David L. Harris, <i>A Case for Project-Based Design Education</i>	61

## Session 3. Design projects as capstone.

Robert M. Counce, John M. Holmes, and Ronald A. Reimer, <i>An Honors Capstone Design Experience Utilizing Authentic Industrial Projects</i>	69
Philip E. Doepker, <i>Integrating the Product Realization Process into the Design Curriculum</i>	75
Dorothy G. Taylor, Spencer P. Magleby, Robert H. Todd, and Alan R. Parkinson, <i>Training Faculty to Coach Capstone Design Teams</i>	81
David M. Cannon and Larry J. Leifer, <i>Product-Based Learning in an Overseas Study Program: The ME110K Course</i>	87

## Session 4. Metrics for selecting design projects.

Patrick Little, <i>Metrics for Choosing Freshman Design Projects</i>	97
Christopher L. Caenepeel and Cheryl Wyrick, <i>Strategies for Successful Interdisciplinary Projects—A California State Polytechnic University, Pomona Perspective</i>	99
Spencer P. Magleby, Robert H. Todd, and Len Pugh, <i>Recruiting and Selecting Appropriate Industrial Projects for Capstone Design Programs</i>	107
Joseph A. King, <i>Metrics for Choosing Clinic Projects: A Harvey Mudd College Perspective</i>	115
Nathan J. Delson, <i>Selecting and Implementing Capstone Engineering Design Projects for High Team Motivation</i>	117

## **Luncheon Talk**

Woodie C. Flowers, *Presence or Telepresence? What Will Professors Do*  
(Written manuscript not available)

## **Session 5. Discipline-based design education.**

Tomasz Arciszewski and Sivand Lakmazaheri, *Designing Structural Design Education* 131

Gregory B. Olson, *Brains of Steel: Mind Melding with Materials* 139

Thomas M. Regan, Guangming Zhang, Patrick F. Cunniff, Linda Schmidt, and  
James W. Dally, *Curriculum Integrated Engineering Design and Product Realization* 145

## **Session 6. Integrated engineering design education.**

Penny L. Hirsch, Barbara L. Shwom, Charles Yarnoff, John C. Anderson, David Kelso,  
Gregory B. Olson, and J. Edward Colgate, *Engineering Design and Communication: The  
Case for Interdisciplinary Collaboration* 157

Benjamin Linder and Woodie C. Flowers, *Integrating Engineering Science and Design:  
A Definition and Discussion* 165

Robert E. Apfel and Natalie Jeremijenko, *SynThesis: Integrating Real World Product  
Design and Business Development with the Challenges of Innovative Instruction* 173

Joseph A. Shaeiwitz, *Teaching Design by Integration throughout the Curriculum and  
Assessing the Curriculum using Design Projects* 181

## **Session 7. Tools and technology in design education.**

Clark Briggs, *On the Role of CAx in Design Education* 189

Sarah Kuhn, *Learning from the Architecture Studio: Implications for Project-Based Pedagogy* 195

Stephen J. Lukasik and Michael A. Erlinger, *Educating Designers of Complex Systems:  
Information Networks as a Testbed* 201

William H. Wood, *Unifying Design Education through Decision Theory* 211

## **Session 8. Assessment: How are we doing?**

Karen F. Yoshino, *Design and Assessment: Theory and Practice* 219

Philip E. Doepker, *Department Assessment and the Design Course: A Model for Continuous  
Improvement* 225

J. Richard Phillips and Ziyad H. Duron, *Assessment in the Light (?) of ABET  
Accreditation Criteria* 233

John M. Feland and Larry J. Leifer, *Requirement Volatility Metrics as an Assessment  
Instrument for Design Team Performance Prediction* 237

## **Luncheon Talk**

Jamie J. Shah, *Promoting Design Skills through Appropriate Grading Criteria*  
(Written manuscript not available)

## **Session 9. What have we learned? What do we recommend?**

John W. Wesner, *Key Learnings and Commitments from Mudd Design Workshop II* 247

**List of Participants** 255

Designing Design Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century  
List of Participants  
19-21 May 1999

---

**Robert E. Apfel**  
Mechanical Engineering  
Yale University  
9 Hillhouse Avenue  
New Haven, CT 06520  
Voice: (203) 432-4346  
FAX: (203) 432-7654  
Email: robert.apfel@yale.edu

**Tomasz Arciszewski**  
Civil, Environmental & Infrastructure  
Engineering Department  
George Mason University  
MS 4A6  
Fairfax, VA 22030  
Voice: (703) 993-1513  
FAX: (703) 993-1521  
Email: tarcisze@gmu.edu

**Bernd Bender**  
Mechanical Engineering Department  
Engineering. Design  
Technical University of Berlin  
Sekt. H10, Strasse des 17. Juni 135  
D-10823 Berlin, GERMANY  
Voice: 4930 31424309  
FAX:  
Email: bernd.bender@kt10.kf.tu-berlin.de

**Clark Briggs**  
Prescient Technologies, Inc.  
280 W. Armstrong Drive  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 480-0357  
FAX:  
Email: clark.briggs@prescienttech.com

**David C. Brown**  
Department of Computer Science  
Worcester Polytechnic Institute

100 Institute Road,  
Worcester, MA 01609  
Voice: (508) 831-5618  
FAX: (508) 831-5776  
Email: dcb@cs.wpi.edu

**Christopher L. Caenepeel**  
Engineering Interdisciplinary Clinic  
Calif. State Polytechnic Univ., Pomona  
3801 W. Temple, Bldg. 9-145  
Pomona, CA 91768  
Voice: (909) 869-4649  
FAX: (909) 869-4684  
Email: clcaenepeel@csupomona.edu

**David M. Cannon**  
Center for Design Research  
Stanford University  
P. O. Box 8416  
Stanford, CA 94309  
Voice: (650) 725-0159  
FAX:  
Email: dmcannon@cdr.stanford.edu

**Philip D. Cha**  
Department of Engineering  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 607-4102  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: philip\_cha@hmc.edu

**Nathan Delson, Director**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Yale University  
Design Studio  
10 Hillhouse Avenue, Bldg. DL 114

Designing Design Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century  
List of Participants  
19-21 May 1999

---

New Haven, CT 06520-8267  
Voice: (203) 432-0030  
FAX: (203) 432-2797  
Email: nathan.delson@yale.edu

**Philip E. Doepker**  
Mechanical and Aero. Engineering  
University of Dayton  
200 College Park Drive  
Dayton, OH 45469-0210  
Voice: (937) 229-2971  
FAX: (937) 229-4922  
Email: pdoepker@enr.dayton.edu

**Ziyad Duron**  
Department of Engineering  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 607-3883  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: ziyad\_duron@hmc.edu

**Clive L. Dym**  
Department of Engineering  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 621-8853  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: clive\_dym@hmc.edu

**Mike Erlinger**  
Department of Computer Science  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 621-8912  
FAX:  
Email: mike\_erlinger@hmc.edu

**Rolf A. Faste**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Stanford University  
Stanford, CA 94305-4021  
Voice: (650) 723-2008  
FAX: (650) 723-3521  
faste@cdr.stanford.edu  
Email: faste@cdr.stanford.edu

**Steven J. Fenves**  
Civil and Environmental Engineering  
Carnegie Mellon University  
Pittsburgh, PA 15213  
Voice: (412) 268-2944  
FAX: (412) 268-7813  
Email: fenves@ce.cmu.edu

**Woodie Flowers**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
77 Massachusetts Avenue, 3-439  
Cambridge, MA 02139  
Voice: (617) 253-6234  
FAX: (617) 253-9637  
Email: flowers@mit.edu

**Frank J. Fronczak**  
Mechanical Engineering Department  
University of Wisconsin-Madison  
1513 University Avenue  
Madison, WI 53706  
Voice: (608) 262-1993  
FAX:  
Email: fronzak@enr.wisc.edu

**Renate Fruchter**  
Dept. of Civil & Environ. Engineering

Designing Design Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century  
List of Participants  
19-21 May 1999

---

Stanford University  
Project Based Learning Laboratory  
CIFE, Bldg. 550  
Stanford, CA 94305-4020  
Voice: (650) 725-1549  
FAX:  
Email: fruchter@cive.stanford.edu

**David L. Harris**  
Department of Engineering  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 607-3623  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: david\_harris@hmc.edu

**George A. Hazelrigg**  
NSF  
4201 Wilson Boulevard  
Arlington, VA 22230  
Voice: (703) 306-1330 x5299  
FAX: (703) 306-0298  
Email: ghazelri@nsf.gov

**Penny L. Hirsch**  
The Writing Program  
Northwestern University  
1902 Sheridan Road  
Evanston, IL 60208  
Voice: (847) 491-4969  
FAX: (909) 864-0472  
Email: phirsch@wnu.edu

**Patrick J. Hollis**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
FAMU-FSU College of Engineering  
2525 Pottsdamer Street  
Tallahassee, FL 32310

Voice: (850) 410-6319  
FAX: (850) 410-6337  
Email: hollis@eng.fsu.edu

**Barry Hyman**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
University of Washington  
Box 352600  
Seattle, WA 98195  
Voice: (206) 543-9038  
FAX: (206) 685-8047  
Email: hyman@u.washington.edu

**Joe King**  
Department of Engineering  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 607-3895  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: joe\_king@hmc.edu

**Sarah Kuhn**  
Dept. of Regional Economic & Social Dev.  
University of Massachusetts Lowell  
61 Wilder Street O'Leary 500J  
Lowell, MA 01854  
Voice: (978) 934-2903  
FAX: (978) 934-4028  
Email: sarah\_kuhn@uml.edu

**Thomas R. Kurfess**  
School of Mechanical Engineering  
Georgia Institute of Technology  
813 Ferst Street  
Atlanta, GA 30332-0405  
Voice: (404) 894-0301  
FAX: (404) 894-9342  
Email: tom.kurfess@me.gatech.edu

Designing Design Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century  
List of Participants  
19-21 May 1999

---

**Sivand Lakmazaheri**  
Civil Engineering Department  
Catholic University of America  
Washington, D.C. 20064  
Voice: (202) 319-6671  
FAX: (202) 319-6677  
Email: lakmazaheri@cua.edu

**Michael C. Larson**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Tulane University  
New Orleans, LA 70118-5674  
Voice: (504) 865-5134  
FAX: (504) 865-4345  
Email: michael.larson@tulane.edu

**Benjamin Linder**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
MIT  
77 Massachusetts Avenue 3-445  
Cambridge, MA 02139  
Voice: (617) 253-2349  
FAX: (617) 253-9637  
Email: blinder@mit.edu

**Pat Little**  
Department of Engineering  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 607-1712  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: patrick\_little@hmc.edu

**Spencer Magleby**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Brigham Young University, 435 CTB

Provo, UT 84602  
Voice: (801) 378-3151  
FAX: (801) 378-5037  
Email: magleby@byu.edu

**Richard K. Miller**  
Olin College of Engineering  
c/o Christine Kelly  
1795 Great Plain Avenue  
Needham, MA 02492-1246  
Voice: (781) 239-3916  
FAX:  
Email: olin1.gen@babson.edu

**John Molinder**  
Department of Engineering  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 607-1682  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: john\_molinder@hmc.edu

**Michael E. Moody**  
Department of Mathematics  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 607-3171  
FAX:  
Email: michael\_moody@hmc.edu

**Gregory B. Olson**  
Dept. of Materials Science & Engineering  
Northwestern University  
2225 N. Campus Drive  
Evanston, IL 60208  
Voice: (847) 491-2847

Designing Design Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century  
List of Participants  
19-21 May 1999

---

FAX:  
Email: g-olson@nwu.edu

**Devdas M. Pai**  
Dept. of Mechanical Engineering  
NC A&T State University  
1601 E. Market Street  
Greensboro, NC 27411  
Voice: (336) 334-7620 x316  
FAX: (336) 334-7417  
Email: pai@ncat.edu

**Frank W. Paul**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Clemson University  
100 Fluor Daniel, Engineering Innovation  
Clemson, SC 29634-0921  
Voice: (864) 656-3291  
FAX: (864) 656-4435  
Email: fwpaul@ces.clemson.edu

**J Richard Phillips**  
Department of Engineering  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 607-3891  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: rich\_phillips@hmc.edu

**Chris D. Pionke**  
Engineering Fundamentals  
University of Tennessee  
101 Perkins Hall  
Knoxville, TN 37996  
Voice: (423) 974-7679  
FAX:  
Email: cpionke@utk.edu

**John W. Prados**  
Department of Chemical Engineering  
The University of Tennessee  
1512 Middle Drive  
Knoxville, TX 37996-2200  
Voice: (423) 974-6053  
FAX: (423) 974-7076  
Email: jprados@utk.edu

**Thomas M. Regan**  
A. James Clark School of Engineering  
University of Maryland  
2105 J. M. Patterson Building  
College Park, MD 20742-2221  
Voice: (310) 405-1936  
FAX: (301) 405-1575  
Email: tregan@eng.umd.edu

**Linda C. Schmidt**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
University of Maryland  
College Park, MD 20742-3035  
Voice: (301) 405-0417  
FAX:  
Email: lschmidt@eng.umd.edu

**Joseph A. Shaeiwitz**  
Chemical Engineering Department  
West Virginia University  
P. O. Box 6102  
Morgantown, WV 26506-6102,  
Voice: (304) 293-2111, x2410  
FAX: (304) 293-4139  
Email: shaeiwitz@cemr.wvu.edu

**Jami J. Shah**  
Mechanical & Aerospace Engineering  
Dept.

Designing Design Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century  
List of Participants  
19-21 May 1999

---

Arizona State/UC Berkeley  
Mail Code 6106  
Tempe, AZ 85287-6106  
Voice: (480) 965-6145  
FAX: (480) 965-2412  
Email: jami.shah@asu.edu

**Sheri Sheppard**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Stanford University  
503 Terman  
Stanford, CA 94305  
Voice: (650) 725-1590  
FAX: (650) 723-3521  
Email: sheppard@cdr.stanford.edu

**Sam Tanenbaum**  
Engineering Department  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 621-8864  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: sam\_tanenbaum@hmc.edu

**Dorothy Taylor**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Brigham Young University  
435 CTB  
Provo, UT 84602  
Voice:  
FAX:  
Email: taylor@byu.edu

**Robert Todd**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Brigham Young University  
435 CTB  
Provo, UT 84602  
Voice:

FAX:  
Email: todd@byu.edu

**John W. Wesner**  
Lucent Technologies  
101 Crawfords Corner Road, Room 2K-303  
Holmdel, NJ 07733-1357  
Voice: (732) 949-7680  
FAX: (732) 949-7512  
Email: jwesner@lucent.com

**William (Bill) H. Wood**  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
UMBC  
234 ECS  
Baltimore, MD 21250  
Voice: (410) 455-3314  
FAX:  
Email: bwood@umbc.edu

**Karen Yoshino**  
Office of the President  
Harvey Mudd College  
301 E. 12th Street  
Claremont, CA 91711  
Voice: (909) 621-18340  
FAX: (909) 621-8967  
Email: karen\_yoshino@hmc.edu